

# APPROXIMATION BY THE TRANSLATES OF A SINGLE FUNCTION

FRANK QUIGLEY

In 1941 Seidel and Walsh [3] proved the existence of an entire function  $F$  of a complex variable such that every function analytic in a simply connected region of the complex plane is the uniform limit on compact sets of a sequence of translates of  $F$ . This result generalizes a theorem of G. D. Birkhoff [1] on entire functions. In the present note an analogous theorem is proved for continuous real or complex functions on a more general class of topological spaces where the role of polynomial approximation in the above proofs is assumed by a sequence of functions constructed using Urysohn's lemma.

Let  $X$  be a locally compact hausdorff space with the following properties: there exist countable sequences  $\{C_n\}$  and  $\{\sigma_n\}$  of disjoint compact sets and homeomorphisms of  $X$  onto itself, respectively, such that for every compact  $K$ , Ia.  $K \cap C_n = \emptyset$  and Ib.  $K \subset C_n \sigma_n$ ,<sup>1</sup> except for finitely many  $n$ . Such an  $X$  is evidently not compact but is countable at infinity, since each point lies in some  $C_n \sigma_n$ . Thus the compact open topology on the algebra  $\mathfrak{A}$  of all continuous real or complex valued functions on  $X$  is the topology of sequential convergence in a suitable Fréchet metric on  $\mathfrak{A}$ .

**THEOREM.** *Let  $X$  be a locally compact hausdorff space with properties Ia and Ib, and let  $\mathfrak{Y}$  be a countable family of continuous real or complex functions on  $X$ . Then there exists a continuous real or complex function  $F$  on  $X$  such that every uniform limit on compact sets of functions in  $\mathfrak{Y}$  is the limit of a sequence of the functions  $F \circ \sigma_n^{-1}$ .*

First we find an infinite subsequence  $\{C_m\}$  of  $\{C_n\}$  and sets  $\Delta_m$  and  $W_m$ , compact and open respectively, such that  $\Delta_m \subset W_m \subset C_m$  and such that  $\{\Delta_m \sigma_m\}$  retains property Ib. Since  $X$  is locally compact, the interiors  $U_n$  of  $C_n \sigma_n$  are nonempty for an infinite set  $J$  of integers, and  $\{U_j, j \in J\}$  has property Ib. In fact, each compact  $K$  has a compact neighborhood  $N$ , and  $N \subset C_j \sigma_j$  for all  $j$  large; thus the interior of  $N$ , which contains  $K$ , is contained in  $U_j$ . The  $C_j \sigma_j, j \in J$ , are compact, so that for each  $j$  there is a least integer  $\gamma(j) \in J$  such that  $C_j \sigma_j \subset U_{\gamma(j)}$ . For each  $m$  in the range  $M$  of the function  $\gamma$  choose  $j$  such that  $\gamma(j) = m$  and define  $\Delta_m = \overline{U_j \sigma_m^{-1}}$  and  $W_m = U_m \sigma_m^{-1}$ . If  $j$  is not in the range

Received by the editors March 5, 1957.

<sup>1</sup> We write  $C_n \sigma_n$  instead of  $\sigma_n(C_n)$ . All indices are positive integers.

of  $\gamma$ , then  $C_j\sigma_j \subset U_{\gamma(j)}$ , and  $\{C_m\sigma_m, m \in M\}$  retains property Ib. Thus  $\{\Delta_m\sigma_m\}$  has property Ib also. Evidently  $\Delta_m \subset W_m \subset C_m$ , since  $\bar{U}_j \subset U_m \subset C_m\sigma_m$ . Reindex the  $\Delta$ 's,  $W$ 's, and  $C$ 's, using all the positive integers.

Next we construct compact sets  $\Gamma_m$  with the properties IIa.  $\Gamma_m \subset \Gamma_{m+1}$ ;  $\cup \Gamma_m = X$ ; every compact  $K \subset \Gamma_m$ , if  $m$  is large. And IIb.  $\cup_{i=1}^m \Delta_i \subset \Gamma_m$  and  $\Gamma_m \cap \Delta_{m+1} = \emptyset$ . Define  $\Gamma_m$  as

$$\bigcup_{i=1}^m \bar{W}_i \cup \left[ \bar{U}_m \cap \mathbf{C} \left( \bigcup_{m+1}^{\infty} W_i \right) \right].$$

Now  $\bar{U}_m \subset \bar{U}_{m+1}$ , and  $\mathbf{C}(U_{m+1}^{\infty} W_i) \subset \mathbf{C}(U_{m+2}^{\infty} W_i)$ ; thus  $\Gamma_m \subset \Gamma_{m+1}$ . Since  $\bar{U}_m$  is compact, so is  $\Gamma_m$ . Further

$$\bar{U}_m \subset \left[ \bar{U}_m \cap \mathbf{C} \left( \bigcup_{m+1}^{\infty} W_i \right) \right] \cup \bigcup_1^{\infty} W_i \subset \bigcup_1^{\infty} \Gamma_m, \text{ and } \cup \Gamma_m = X.$$

Since  $W_m \subset C_m$ , each compact  $K$  meets only finitely many  $W_m$  and lies in all but finitely many  $\bar{U}_m$ ; thus  $K \subset \Gamma_m$  for all  $m$  large. The first part of IIb is trivial. For the second part, observe that  $\bar{W}_m \subset C_m$  and  $C_m \cap \Delta_{m+1} = \emptyset$ . Also  $[\bar{U}_m \cap \mathbf{C}(U_{m+1} W_i)] \subset \mathbf{C}W_{m+1}$  and  $\Delta_{m+1} \subset W_{m+1}$ . Thus  $\Gamma_m \cap \Delta_{m+1} = \emptyset$ .

We are now in a position to construct  $F$ . Let  $\{f_m\}$  be the family  $\mathfrak{F}$  indexed by the positive integers, in such a way that each function is repeated countably often, and construct continuous functions  $\alpha_m, \beta_m$ , and  $g_m$  as follows, using Urysohn's lemma:

$$\alpha_m(x) = \begin{cases} 0 & \text{on } \Delta_m, \\ 1 & \text{on } \Gamma_{m-1}, \end{cases} \quad \beta_m(x) = \begin{cases} 1 & \text{on } \Delta_m, \\ 0 & \text{on } \Gamma_{m-1}, \end{cases}$$

$$\begin{cases} g_1(x) = f_1(x), \\ g_m(x) = \alpha_m(x)g_{m-1}(x) + \beta_m(x)f_m(x\sigma_m). \end{cases}$$

Observe that  $g_m(x) = g_{m-1}(x)$  on  $\Gamma_{m-1}$  and that  $g_m(x) = f_m(x\sigma_m)$  on  $\Delta_m$ . Since each compact  $K$  lies in all  $\Gamma_m$  from some  $m$  on, the sequence  $\{g_m\}$  converges uniformly on compact sets to a limit  $F$ ; this function is continuous, since it coincides with a continuous function on each compact set, and the space  $X$  is locally compact. Now  $F(x) = g_m(x)$  on  $\Gamma_m \supset \Delta_m$ , so that  $F(x) = f_m(x\sigma_m)$  on  $\Delta_m$ . Let  $y \in \Delta_m\sigma_m$  and write  $y = x\sigma_m$  for some  $x \in \Delta_m$ . Then  $F(y\sigma_m^{-1}) = F(x) = f_m(x\sigma_m) = f_m(y)$  for  $y \in \Delta_m\sigma_m$ . The sequence  $\{\Delta_m\sigma_m\}$  has property Ib; so suppose that the sequence  $\{f_{n_i}\}$  of functions from  $\mathfrak{F}$  converges uniformly on compact sets to a function  $f$ . For each compact  $K$  there is an  $i_0$  such that  $K \subset \Delta_{n_i}\sigma_{n_i}$ ;

for  $i \geq i_0$ .<sup>2</sup> But  $f_{n_i}(y) = F(y\sigma_{n_i}^{-1})$  for  $y \in \Delta_{n_i}\sigma_{n_i}$ ,  $i \geq i_0$ . Thus  $\{F(y\sigma_{n_i}^{-1})\}$  converges uniformly to  $f$  on  $K$ .

**COROLLARY 1.** *The theorem can be proved under hypothesis Ib and the following condition: Ia'. There exist open sets  $V_n \supset C_n$  such that  $V_n \cap C_m = \emptyset$ , if  $n \neq m$ , and the set  $UC_n$  is closed.*

It is enough to show that for every compact  $K$ ,  $K \cap C_n = \emptyset$ , except for finitely many  $n$ . Assume that  $K \cap C_m \neq \emptyset$  for an infinite subset  $M$  of  $\{n\}$ , and choose  $p_m \in K \cap C_m$  for each  $m \in M$ . Then  $\{p_m\}$  is an infinite point set, which must have a limit point  $p$  in  $K \cap \text{cl}(UC_m)$ . But if  $p \in \text{cl}(UC_m)$ , then  $p \in UC_n$ , since  $UC_n$  is closed, and so  $p \in C_r$  for some  $r$ . Thus infinitely many  $p_m$  lie in  $V_r$ , which is impossible for  $m \neq r$ ; consequently  $K \cap C_n = \emptyset$ , for all  $n$  large.

**COROLLARY 2.** *If  $X$  is a differentiable manifold of class  $r$ ,  $1 \leq r \leq \infty$ , and if the  $\sigma_n$  and the  $f_n$  are of class  $r$ , then  $F$  can be found also of class  $r$ .*

The functions  $\alpha_m$  and  $\beta_m$  can be chosen of class  $r$ ,<sup>3</sup> so that the  $g_n$  are also of class  $r$ . For each point  $p \in X$ , choose a compact neighborhood  $N$ . Then for some  $m$ ,  $N \subset \Gamma_m$ ; on  $\Gamma_m$  the function  $F$  equals  $g_m$ , which is of class  $r$ . Thus  $F$  has class  $r$ .

#### REFERENCES

1. G. D. Birkhoff, *Démonstration d'un théorème élémentaire sur les fonctions entières*, Collected Papers, vol. III, pp. 307-309.
2. G. de Rham, *Variétés différentiables*, Paris, 1955.
3. W. Seidel and J. L. Walsh, *On approximation by euclidean and non-euclidean translations of an analytic function*, Bull. Amer. Math. Soc. vol. 47 (1941) pp. 916-920.

#### YALE UNIVERSITY

<sup>2</sup> If  $n_i = m_0$  for infinitely many  $i$ , then  $\lim f_{n_i} = f_{m_0}$ . Since  $f_{m_0}$  occurs countably often among the  $f_m$ , it is the limit of translates of  $F$ .

<sup>3</sup> See for example [2, p. 6].