

Below are some extra examples for Math 300. These examples are to augment the lectures and help you do some of the assigned homework problems.

1. To show  $(P \wedge R) \vee (\neg R \wedge (P \vee Q))$  is equivalent to  $P \vee (\neg R \wedge Q)$ :

$$\begin{aligned}
 & (P \wedge R) \vee (\neg R \wedge (P \vee Q)) \\
 & \text{is equivalent to} \\
 & (P \wedge R) \vee (\neg R \wedge P) \vee (\neg R \wedge Q) \quad \text{(distributive and associative laws)} \\
 & \text{is equivalent to} \\
 & ((P \wedge R) \vee \neg R) \wedge ((P \wedge R) \vee P) \vee (\neg R \wedge Q) \quad \text{(distributive law)} \\
 & \text{is equivalent to} \\
 & (((P \wedge R) \vee \neg R) \wedge P) \vee (\neg R \wedge Q) \quad \text{(absorbtion)} \\
 & \text{is equivalent to} \\
 & ((\neg R \vee P) \wedge (\neg R \vee R) \wedge P) \vee (\neg R \wedge Q) \quad \text{(distributive law)} \\
 & \text{is equivalent to} \\
 & P \vee (\neg R \wedge Q) \quad \text{(absorbtion and tautology)}
 \end{aligned}$$

2. Enumeration of all logical connective possibilities.

	$P$ F	$Q$ F	$P$ F	$Q$ T	$P$ T	$Q$ F	$P$ T	$Q$ T
contradiction	F	F	F	F	F	F	F	F
$P \wedge Q$	F	F	F	F	F	F	T	T
$P \wedge \neg Q$	F	F	F	T	T	F	F	F
$P$	F	F	F	T	T	T	T	T
$\neg P \wedge Q$	F	T	T	F	F	F	F	F
$Q$	F	T	T	T	F	F	T	T
$P \oplus Q$	F	T	T	F	T	T	F	F
$P \vee Q$	F	T	T	T	T	T	T	T
$\neg(P \vee Q)$	T	F	F	F	F	F	F	F
$P \leftrightarrow Q, \neg(P \oplus Q)$	T	F	F	F	F	T	T	T
$\neg Q$	T	F	T	F	T	T	F	F
$P \vee \neg Q$	T	F	T	T	T	T	T	T
$\neg P$	T	T	T	T	F	F	F	F
$P \rightarrow Q, \neg P \vee Q$	T	T	T	T	F	T	T	T
$\neg(P \wedge Q)$	T	T	T	T	T	T	F	F
tautology	T	T	T	T	T	T	T	T

3. Suppose we wish to show that  $\exists x(P(x) \rightarrow Q(x))$  is equivalent to  $\forall xP(x) \rightarrow \exists xQ(x)$ .

By the conditional laws (given on page 47 of Velleman),

$$\exists x(P(x) \rightarrow Q(x))$$

is equivalent to

$$\exists x(\neg P(x) \vee Q(x)). \tag{1}$$

Now, any statement  $\exists x(R(x) \vee S(x))$  means that there exists an  $x$  such that  $R(x)$  or  $S(x)$  is true. That is equivalent to saying that there exists an  $x$  such that  $R(x)$  is true, or there exists an  $x$  such that  $S(x)$  is true. That is,

$$\exists x(R(x) \vee S(x)) \text{ is equivalent to } \exists xR(x) \vee \exists xS(x)$$

Thus, expression (1) is equivalent to

$$\exists x\neg P(x) \vee \exists xQ(x)$$

and this is equivalent, by our quantifier negation laws, to

$$\neg\forall xP(x) \vee \exists xQ(x)$$

and this is equivalent to

$$\forall xP(x) \rightarrow \exists xQ(x)$$

by our conditional laws.

Along these same lines, note that

$$\forall x(R(x) \wedge S(x))$$

says that for all  $x$ ,  $R(x)$  and  $S(x)$  are true. This is equivalent to saying that for all  $x$   $R(x)$  is true and for all  $x$   $S(x)$  is true (the latter just takes longer to say!). Hence,  $\forall x(R(x) \wedge S(x))$  is equivalent to

$$\forall xR(x) \wedge \forall xS(x).$$

#### 4. An example of a uniqueness argument.

**Theorem:** Let  $S$  be a set. For every  $A \in \mathcal{P}(S)$ , there is a unique  $B \in \mathcal{P}(S)$  such that for every  $C \in \mathcal{P}(S)$ ,  $C \setminus A = C \cap B$ .

*Proof.* Let  $S$  be a set. Let  $A \in \mathcal{P}(S)$ . Let  $B = S \setminus A$ . Then, let  $C \in \mathcal{P}(S)$ .

Suppose  $x \in C \setminus A$ . So,  $x \in C$  and  $x \notin A$ , so  $x \in B$ .

Hence,  $x \in B \cap C$ . Thus,  $C \setminus A \subseteq C \cap B$ .

Suppose  $x \in C \cap B$ . Then  $x \in C$  and  $x \in B$ , so  $x \notin A$ .

Hence,  $x \in C \setminus A$ . Thus,  $C \cap B \subseteq C \setminus A$ .

Thus,  $C \cap B = C \setminus A$ .

Thus there exists a set with the required property, namely  $B = S \setminus A$ .

To show uniqueness, suppose a set  $D$  in  $\mathcal{P}(S)$  also has the required property.

Then for all  $C \in \mathcal{P}(S)$ ,  $C \cap D = C \setminus A$ .

Since for all  $C \in \mathcal{P}(S)$ ,  $C \cap B = C \setminus A$ , we have that for all  $C \in \mathcal{P}(S)$ ,

$$C \cap B = C \cap D.$$

In particular, if we let  $C=B$ , we have  $B \cap B = B \cap D$ , i.e.,  $B = B \cap D$ . This shows that  $B \subseteq D$ , since if  $x \in B$ ,  $x$  is also in  $D$ .

On the other hand, if we let  $C=D$ , we have  $D \cap D = D \cap B$ , i.e.,  $D = D \cap B$ . This shows that  $D \subseteq B$ , since if  $x \in D$ ,  $x$  is also in  $B$ .

Hence,  $D = B$ . And so the choice of  $B$  is unique. □

## 5. A surprising bijection.

Let's consider the intervals of real numbers  $A = (0, 1]$  and  $B = (0, 1)$ . Since both  $A$  and  $B$  contain an infinite number of elements, and  $B$  is simply  $A$  with one element (1) removed, it would be surprising if  $A$  and  $B$  were not equinumerous. However, if we try to find a bijection from one set to the other using combinations of our standard functions (e.g. trig functions, rational functions, etc.), we find that a bijection eludes us.

It turns out that it is possible, but it requires a surprising bit of cleverness. First, consider this function from  $A$  to  $B$ :

$$f(x) = \begin{cases} 1/2 & \text{if } x = 1, \\ x & \text{if } x \neq 1. \end{cases}$$

Notice that this *almost* works. It maps the set  $(0, 1]$  onto the set  $(0, 1)$ , but it is not one-to-one:  $f(1) = f(1/2)$ .

To fix this, we might try sending  $1/2$  to something else:

$$g(x) = \begin{cases} 1/3 & \text{if } x = 1/2, \\ 1/2 & \text{if } x = 1, \\ x & \text{if } x \neq 1 \text{ and } x \neq 1/2. \end{cases}$$

Again,  $g$  maps the set  $(0, 1]$  onto  $(0, 1)$  and now  $f(1) \neq f(1/2)$ , but now  $f(1/2) = f(1/3)$  so it is again not one-to-one.

One more try: let's send  $1/3$  to something else:

$$h(x) = \begin{cases} 1/4 & \text{if } x = 1/3, \\ 1/3 & \text{if } x = 1/2, \\ 1/2 & \text{if } x = 1, \\ x & \text{if } x \neq 1, x \neq 1/2, \text{ and } x \neq 1/3. \end{cases}$$

This function maps the set  $(0, 1]$  onto  $(0, 1)$  and  $h(1) \neq h(1/2)$  and  $h(1/2) \neq h(1/3)$ , but now  $h(1/3) = h(1/4)$ , so  $h$  is not one-to-one.

Although this doesn't seem to be working, if we *extend this strategy forever*, we get a function that does work.

Let  $k : A \rightarrow B$  be defined like this:

$$k(x) = \begin{cases} \frac{1}{n+1} & \text{if } x = 1/n \text{ for some } n \in \mathbb{Z}_{>0}, \\ x & \text{if } x \neq 1/n \text{ for all } n \in \mathbb{Z}_{>0}. \end{cases}$$

So we have  $k(1) = 1/2$ ,  $k(1/2) = 1/3$ ,  $k(1/3) = 1/4$ ,  $k(1/4) = 1/5$ , etc. We are basically pushing our problem down the sequence of  $1/n$ , and since this sequence is infinite, it becomes a non-problem.

It is not too hard to show that our  $k$  function is a bijection from  $A$  to  $B$ , and this shows that  $A$  and  $B$  are equinumerous.